

**Methodological recommendations
for conducting
accreditation external review**

Moscow, 2020

Contents

1. GENERAL PROVISIONS	3
2. NORMATIVE AND LEGAL BASIS OF THE ACCREDITATION EXTERNAL REVIEW	5
3. PROCEDURE OF SELECTING EXPERTS FOR EXTERNAL REVIEWS, PREPARATION FOR THE EXTERNAL REVIEW	9
4. PECULIARITIES OF CONDUCTING THE ACCREDITATION EXTERNAL REVIEW	11
<i>4.1. External review with a site visit</i>	11
<i>4.2. External review without a site visit</i>	11
<i>4.3. External review of study programs delivered exclusively by means of e-learning, distance learning technologies</i>	12
<i>4.4. External review of study programs delivered with the use of a network form</i> ..	12
<i>4.5. External review of basic study programmes delivered by educational standards, established by the educational organization on an independent basis</i>	13
5. PROCEDURE FOR CONDUCTING THE EXTERNAL REVIEW (EXPERT PANEL WORK)	14
<i>5.1. Preliminary analysis</i>	17
<i>5.2. Carrying out external review with a site visit to the educational organization or its branch</i>	18
<i>5.3. Carrying out external review without a site visit to the educational organization or its branch</i>	21
<i>5.4. Carrying out external review in an e-form</i>	22
6. REPORTING DOCUMENTATION	24
7. PROCEDURE FOR MAKING THE DECISION ON STATE ACCREDITATION, REFUSAL OF STATE ACCREDITATION	26

These methodological recommendations for conducting accreditation external review (hereinafter – Recommendations) shall help expert panel members in carrying out the external review.

The Recommendations are developed in accordance with the legislation on education in the Russian Federation in force as of 01.01.2020.

1.GENERAL PROVISIONS

In accordance with Article 92 of the Federal Law of December 29, 2012, № 273-FL “On Education in the Russian Federation” (hereinafter – the Federal Law on Education), the state accreditation of educational activities in basic study programs implemented as provided by the federal state educational standards (hereinafter – FSES), except educational programs of pre-school education, including as provided by educational standards.

The purpose of state accreditation of educational activities is to confirm the compliance with the FSEs of educational activities on basic study programs (hereinafter - BSP) and students’ training in educational organizations (hereinafter EOs) and organizations providing training.

The subject of the external review is to determine the compliance of the content and quality of students’ training in the organization carrying out educational activities in the study programs declared for state accreditation with FSES. During the accreditation external review of educational activities in educational programs implemented in accordance with educational standards, the external review of the content of students’ training is not conducted.

Principles of carrying out the accreditation external review:

- objectivity;
- responsibility of experts and (or) expert organizations for the conduct and the quality of the external review;
- competence and independence of experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations.

Principle of objectivity of the external review. The external review is conducted on the basis of documents and materials submitted by the educational organization and verified by experts during the external review, interviews (survey) with students and teaching staff of the organization on their satisfaction with the quality of education and educational activities.

Principle of the experts’ responsibility for the conduct and quality of the external review. As a result of the work in the educational organization, each expert panel member draws up a report on the external review of the study programs he/she is responsible for. In the report, he/she makes a conclusion on

compliance (non-compliance) of the content and the quality of students' training with the relevant FSES requirements in the relevant integrated group of professions, specialties and fields of training. The experts' reports are the basis of the expert conclusion that is reviewed by the accreditation body when making the decision on state accreditation. The experts are responsible for the quality of the external review as provided in the current legislation and agreements on carrying out external review concluded with the accreditation body.

Principle of the experts' competence. Experts and (or) expert organizations carrying out external reviews shall have necessary qualifications in study programmes declared for the state accreditation and their qualification shall meet the established requirements.

The qualification requirements to experts and expert organizations, the procedure for the selection of experts and expert organizations to conduct the external review are established by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia No. 556 of 20.05.2014.

Experts and expert organizations cannot be in civil law relations (experts also cannot be in employment relations) with the EO during the external review of its educational activities.

When carrying out the state accreditation of educational activities in BSP, the accreditation body considers the expert group's conclusion and makes a decision on granting the state accreditation or on the refusal of state accreditation of educational activities in the relevant BSP in respect of each level of professional education for each integrated group of specialties and fields of training (hereinafter referred to as IGSFT), which include the BSPs declared for state accreditation.

When making the decision on state accreditation, in accordance with Part 19 of Article 92 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" the accreditation body issues a certificate of state accreditation (hereinafter - the certificate) that is valid for 6 years for the organizations carrying out educational activities to implement basic professional study programs.

In case of refusal of state accreditation, the EO has the right to resubmit the application not earlier than 1 year after it.

2. NORMATIVE AND LEGAL BASIS OF THE ACCREDITATION EXTERNAL REVIEW

1. The Federal Law of 29.12.2012 № 273-FL “On Education in the Russian Federation”.

2. Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of 18.11.2013 № 1039 “On state accreditation of educational activities” (with the Regulations on state accreditation of educational activities).

3. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 16.09.2014 № 1227 “On approval of the administrative regulation of Rosobrnadzor’s providing the public service of state accreditation”.

4. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 20.05.2014 № 556 “On approval of qualification requirements to experts and expert organizations, procedures of their certification, inter alia the maintenance of the register of experts and expert organizations, selection of experts and expert organizations for external review”.

5. Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of 24.04.2013 № 370 «On approval of service fee for experts and expert organizations and expense reimbursement incurred at the time of the external review».

6. Order of the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science (hereinafter referred to as Rosobrnadzor) of 14.07.2018 № 809 “On setting the labor expenditures standard and ratios influencing the level of work difficulty depending on the number of students at the educational organization in the study programs declared for state accreditation”.

7. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 22.09.2014 № 1273 “On approval of the procedure for inclusion of experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations in the expert panel when carrying out external review of professional study programs, containing information constituting a state secret and delivered by an educational organization under the jurisdiction of the federal executive authority in the field of security, the federal authority responsible for the development and implementation of state policy, normative legal regulation, control and supervision in the sphere of state protection, communication for the needs of public authorities, the federal authority responsible for the development and implementation of the state policy and normative legal regulation in the sphere of defense, the federal executive body responsible for the elaboration and implementation of the state policy and normative legal regulation in the sphere of internal affairs, the federal executive power body responsible for working out state policy, normative legal regulation, control and supervision in the field of distribution of narcotic drugs, psychotropic substances and their precursors, as well as counteracting their illicit trafficking.”

8. Order of Rosobrnadzor of 29.11.2019 № 1628 “On approval of the application forms for state accreditation of educational activities, on reissuing the certificate of state accreditation and /or its annex (annexes), on issuing a temporary certificate of state accreditation, on issuing of a duplicate of the state accreditation certificate and /or its annex (annexes), a form of information on the implementation of basic study programs declared for state accreditation, and requirements for their completion and registration”

9. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 12.01.2015 № 3 “On approval of the forms the information attached to the application for state accreditation of study programs shall be submitted by a diplomatic mission and consular institution of the Russian Federation, a representative office of the Russian Federation of international (interstate, intergovernmental) organizations”.

10. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 5.04.2017 № 301 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of higher education – Bachelor’s, Specialist and Master’s programs.

11. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 19.11.2013 № 1258 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of higher education – Residency programs.

12. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 19.11.2013 № 1259 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of higher education – study programs of training the academic staff in (military) postgraduate education”.

13. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 14.06.2013 № 464 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on study programs of secondary vocational education and training”.

14. Order of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation of 12.01.2015 № 1 “On approval of the procedure for carrying out educational activities on assistantship study programs including the admission procedure on assistantship study programs”.

15. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 18.11.2013 № 1245 “ On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher education – Bachelor’s Master’s and Specialist approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 12, 2013, № 1061, to the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding Bachelor’s and Master’s degrees ratified by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.09.2009 № 337, to the fields of training in higher professional

education confirmed by awarding a person a Specialist's degree approved by the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of 30.12.2009 № 1136."

16. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 10.01.2014 № 4 "On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher education - training of highly qualified personnel on residency and internship programs approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 12, 2013 г. № 1061, to the specialties of specialists with higher and postgraduate medical and pharmaceutical education in the sphere of health care of the Russian Federation, specified in the nomenclature approved by the order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation of April 23, 2009, № 210n, to the fields of training (specialties) of postgraduate vocational education for students in the form of assistant-internship ratified by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation on February 22, 2012, № 127".

17. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.02.2011 № 201 "On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding the qualifications (degrees) of "Bachelor" and "Master", and approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 17, 2009, № 337, fields of training (specialties) of higher professional education, confirmed by awarding a person the qualification (degree) of "specialist", the list of which was approved by the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation № 1136 of December 30, 2009, to the fields of training (specialties) of higher professional education specified in the All-Russian Classifier of Specialties on Education OK 009-2003, adopted and enacted by the Decree of the State Committee of the Russian Federation on Standardization and Metrology from September 30, 2003, № 276-st."

18. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 13.07.2016 № 857 "On establishing the correspondence of the fields of training in higher education used in the implementation of Master's and specialist programs containing the data constituting state secrets or proprietary information of limited distribution the list of which was approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of September 12, 2009 №1060, to the fields of training in higher professional education confirmed by awarding a "Master's" qualification (degree) used in the implementation of study programs of higher professional education containing the data constituting state secrets or proprietary information of limited distribution the list of which was approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of June 28, 20010 №731, and to the fields of training (specialties) in higher professional education confirmed by

awarding a "Specialist" qualification (degree) and approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of December 30, 20010 №1136".

19. The Federal Law of July 27, 2006 № 152-FL "On personal data protection".

20. The Federal Law of 27.07.2006 № 149-FL "On information, information technologies and information protection".

21. The Federal law of 28.03.1998 № 53-FL "On military obligations and service".

22. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 09.11.2016 № 1385 "On approval of the list of documents and materials necessary to carry out an external review with (or without) a site visit to an educational organization or its branch".

23. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 09.11.2016 № 1386 "On approval of the rules of procedure for experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations when carrying out the external review".

24. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.01.2017 № 24 "On approval of the forms of the external review report and the conclusion made by experts and (or) expert organizations, compiled on the external review results".

25. Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 23.08.2017 № 816 "On approval of the procedure for application of e-learning forms and on-line educational technologies by educational organizations when delivering study programs".

Useful links

Official Internet-portal of legal documents <http://pravo.gov.ru/>

Model basic programs of general education <http://fgosreestr.ru/>

Model basic study programs of secondary professional education <https://fumo-spo.ru/>
(since 2019)

FSES portal <http://fgosvo.ru/>

Professional standards <http://profstandart.rosmintrud.ru/>

3. PROCEDURE OF SELECTING EXPERTS FOR EXTERNAL REVIEWS, PREPARATION FOR THE EXTERNAL REVIEW

In order to conduct an external review, the accreditation body nominates experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations from the Register of experts and expert organizations posted on the Information system of state accreditation (hereinafter ISSA) by means of an automated random selection using the following parameters:

a) the level of education (for general education), IGSFT (for professional education) in respect of which the expert (expert organization) is certified to conduct the external review;

b) the place of residence or place of stay of the expert (the location of the expert organization);

c) if nominating an expert (expert organization) for carrying out the external review of basic study programs containing information constituting a state secret: the expert's access (admission) to work with official information, as well as with the information constituting state secrets; the expert organization's license to work using information constituting state secrets of the corresponding level of classification;

d) when carrying out the external review in the e-form - a qualified electronic signature (hereinafter – e-signature) obligatory for the expert.

The expert panel consists of:

- the head of the expert panel appointed from the members of the expert panel in accordance with professional and personal competence;
- experts, representatives of expert organizations with professional competence corresponding to the field of BSPs declared for state accreditation.

Certified international experts with the necessary qualifications in the field of BSPs declared for state accreditation in the relevant field of training (specialty) may be involved in the external review.

When conducting an accreditation external review of professional study programs containing information constituting state secrets implemented by an organization carrying out educational activities, the experts must meet the requirements to the experts and (or) representatives of the expert organizations and must be eligible for work with information constituting the state secret of the corresponding secrecy degree and admitted to it in the established procedure. Experts are guided by the requirements of the Russian Federation Law of 21.07.1993 № 5485-1 "On State Secrets" and the relevant authorities' regulations.

Involving experts and (or) expert organizations to conduct an external review of study programs delivered by an educational organization and each of

its branches shall be implemented in accordance with an executive order on conducting the external review and civil law contract made with them.

The executive order of an accreditation body on conducting the external review, which determines the composition of experts and (or) representatives of expert organizations (hereinafter referred to as expert panel) shall specify:

- a) full name of the accreditation body;
- b) full name of an educational organization or branch, which are the subject to external review;
- c) begin and end dates of the external review procedure;
- d) full names of experts (or) representatives of expert organizations included into an expert panel (hereinafter referred to as members of the expert panel), indicating the person appointed as the head of the expert panel;
- e) list of study programs assigned to each expert panel member with the indication of the level of education, the integrated group of professions, specialties, and fields of training;
- f) full name of the accreditation body officer supervising the expert panel work during the external review procedure and responsible for the review of the expert panel conclusion on the external review results.

The accreditation body's executive order is issued within 30 days of the receipt of the organization's application and the documents attached for consideration on its merits. Within 3 working days from the date of the order issuance, its electronic copy (the scanned document) is emailed to the educational organization and the head of the expert panel.

After Rosobrnadzor's issuing executive order on conducting the accreditation external review (in e-form as well), the head and the members of the expert panel get the login and password to the personal accounts in ISSA.

4. PECULIARITIES OF CONDUCTING THE ACCREDITATION EXTERNAL REVIEW

The accreditation external review can be conducted with or without a site visit to the educational organization or its branch. The procedure for conducting the external review is determined by the accreditation body in accordance with paragraphs 33-35 of the Regulations on state accreditation of educational activities.

4.1. External review with a site visit

The external review with a site visit to the educational organization is conducted at the address specified in the supplement to the license for carrying out educational activities.

The expert panel use workplaces provided with the educational organization. The workplace must be a separate isolated office room (rooms) ensuring the safety of documents. It must be equipped with access to the Internet and with necessary furniture and other organizational and technical means necessary for work (printer, scanner, copier, stationery), including communications equipment, personal computers with secured access to electronic legal reference systems.

4.2. External review without a site visit

By the decision of an accreditation body, the external review is conducted without a site visit to an educational organization or its branch if study programs declared for state accreditation are delivered by:

a) a Russian educational organization located outside the territory of the Russian Federation;

b) an educational organization founded in accordance with the international treaty of the Russian Federation and carrying out educational activities outside the territory of the Russian Federation;

c) a foreign educational organization carrying out educational activities outside the territory of the Russian Federation;

d) an organization carrying out educational activities pursuing to get a reissued certificate of state accreditation on the study programmes that have not been accredited before, with the exception of study programmes containing information constituting state secrets;

e) the organization carrying out educational activities specified in paragraph 7 of Part 1 of Article 6 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation", with the exception of organizations carrying out educational activities with study programs not accredited before and being granted the state accreditation for the first time, as well as organizations carrying out educational activities on study programmes containing information

constituting the state secrets;

f) the organization carrying out educational activities with the information on an independent evaluation of the quality of students' training in the study programmes declared for state accreditation that is taken into account in the state accreditation procedure as established by Section V(1) of the Regulations on state accreditation.

The accreditation external review without a site visit is conducted at the location address of the accreditation body. In case of conducting the external review in an e-form, it is carried out at the expert's place of residence and (or) the expert's place of employment.

4.3. External review of study programs delivered exclusively by means of e-learning, distance learning technologies

When conducting an external review of study programs delivered exclusively by means of e-learning, distance learning technologies, an expert panel shall have access to the electronic information-educational environment in order to analyze the students' learning outcomes and determine whether students have an opportunity to comprehensively acquire study programs, regardless of their location.

4.4. External review of study programs delivered with the use of a network form

When conducting the external review of the study programs implemented using a network form:

a) in the case the study programmes of an educational organization with which an agreement on the network form of study programmes implementation has been concluded, are state-accredited, the accreditation body shall take into account the results of the previous state accreditation, and the external review is conducted for the study programmes implemented by the organization carrying out educational activities independently;

b) in the case the study programmes of an educational organization with which an agreement on the network form of study programmes implementation has been concluded, are not state-accredited, the accreditation body takes into account the students' results obtained during the mastering of study programmes in the organization, participating in the implementation of study programmes in a network form.

4.5. External review of basic study programmes delivered by educational standards, established by the educational organization on an independent basis

When conducting the external review of basic study programs by such educational standards, the expert (the representative of the expert organization) evaluates the quality of students' training in accordance with the level of the implemented study program by analyzing the students' learning outcomes.

In accordance with Part 10 of Article 11 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation", the requirements to the conditions for the implementation and results of mastering the BSP specified in the educational standard can't be lower than the corresponding FSES requirements.

5. PROCEDURE FOR CONDUCTING THE EXTERNAL REVIEW (EXPERT PANEL WORK)

The procedure for the work of experts included in the expert panel during the external review is approved by the order of the Ministry of Education And Science of the Russian Federation of 09.11.2016 № 1386.

When carrying out the external review, the expert panel uses:

a) the application and the attached documents specified in paragraphs 8, 9 – 12 of the Regulations on state accreditation;

b) documents and materials received upon the written request of the expert panel (in the case of conducting the external review without the site visit - upon the request of the accreditation body) from the organization in accordance with the list of documents and materials required for conducting the external review established by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science;

c) information on the independent evaluation of the quality of the students' training in respect of the study programmes declared for state accreditation, stipulated by Section V(1) of the Regulations on state accreditation;

d) information on the results of the evaluation of the quality of students' training as a result of assessing the learning outcomes achieved by them in the study programmes declared for state accreditation.

Functions of the expert panel member.

When carrying out the accreditation external review, a member of the expert panel:

- cooperates with the National Accreditation Agency (hereinafter NAA), receives and analyzes the assignment for the accreditation external review;

- shows identification documents to the head or other official representative of the organization;

- studies and analyzes the documents and materials necessary for carrying out the external review;

- analyzes the documents and materials posted by the organization on the official website;

- carries out the accreditation external review of the study programmes assigned to him/her in the executive order of the accreditation body and the civil law contract concluded with him/her;

- draws up the report on the external review in the form approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17.01.2017 № 24.

Functions of the head of the expert panel

The head of the expert panel is appointed from among the members of the

expert panel specified in the accreditation body's executive order on the accreditation external review. He/she is responsible for the organization and coordination of work during the external review. In addition to the functions of the expert panel member, within the framework of organization and coordination of the works on conducting the external review, the head of the expert panel performs the following functions:

- provide the head of the organization with a copy of the accreditation body's executive order on conducting the accreditation external review, and also with a copy of the executive order on making changes to the executive order on conducting the accreditation external review (if any changes occurred) (when conducting the external review with the site visit);
- cooperate with NAA, receive and analyze the assignment for the accreditation external review in terms of its organization and conduct;
- receive documents and materials necessary for conducting the external review;
- contact the head of the organization (with the site visit) or the NAA officer (without the site visit) to clarify the working hours of the organization or NAA;
- draw up the schedule of the external review taking into account the working schedule of the organization or NAA (without the site visit) and the dates of the beginning and the ending of the external review established in the executive order on conducting the accreditation external review;
- inform the members of the expert panel and the head of the organization (with the site visit) or NAA (without the site visit) about the schedule of the external review;
- make a written request from the organization for documents and materials necessary for conducting the external review as specified in the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia of 09.11.2016 №1385, and take them as per the list of contents/ inventory (with the site visit);
- hand over the documents and materials necessary for conducting the external review received from the organization (with the site visit) or NAA (without the site visit) members of the expert panel;
- inform the organization's head on the revealed non-compliances of the content and (or) the quality of the students' training with the FSES requirements (in case of the external review with the site visit) in the established order and in the form of a notice of non-compliance of the content and (or) the quality of the students' training with the FSES requirements;
- hand over the documents received from the organization and confirming the elimination of the non-compliance (including in the form of an e-document with the e-signature of the head of the organization) to the expert panel members;

- review the reports of the expert panel members to draw up the expert panel conclusion in the form established by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science;

- draw up the expert panel conclusion the upon completion of the external review, send this conclusion with the attached reports on the accreditation external review to NAA within 3 working days after the end of the external review, and also within 1 working day from signing the conclusion of the expert panel, send the electronic copy of the scanned conclusion to NAA's e-mail (in case of conducting the external review with a site visit).

When conducting the external review of each study program declared for state accreditation, the expert panel shall:

- determine the compliance of the content of students' training (curriculum, schedule, working programs of disciplines (modules), programs of practices, evaluation tools, methodological materials) and conditions of students' training with the FSES requirements;

- determine the quality of students' training, evaluate the degree of students' achievement of the study program learning outcomes, and (or) planned results of training in a discipline (module), practice.

When conducting state accreditation, they take into account the information on the independent evaluation of the students' training quality in the study programs declared for state accreditation in the organization carrying out educational activities.

The expert panel takes into account the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality in case they have been received by the accreditation body and carried out within 3 years prior to the submission of the state accreditation application. This independent evaluation must be conducted by the legal entities carrying out an independent evaluation of the students' training quality in accordance with Article 95.1 of the Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" (hereinafter referred to as organizations), that:

- a) use evaluation tools recommended by the federal educational and methodical associations in accordance with the standard regulations on educational and methodical associations in the education system and/or that have been agreed upon by the Council on Professional Qualifications (if any) when carrying out an independent evaluation of the students' training quality;

- b) belong to all-Russian or other associations of employers, associations (unions) or other organizations representing and/or uniting the professional community in the professional sphere;

- c) involve experts with the qualifications corresponding to the levels of education and professions, specialties, and fields of training under the independent evaluation of the students' training quality.

The expert panel also takes into account the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality received as part of international comparative research in education in accordance with the criteria and requirements of Russian, foreign and international organizations.

The results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality are taken into account at state accreditation in case the information on the independent evaluation of the students' training quality is submitted to the accreditation body together with the information on the compliance of the organization that has conducted it, with the requirements specified in paragraph 58(2) of the Regulations on state accreditation.

In case the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality confirm the compliance of the training quality in the study programmes declared for state accreditation with the learning outcomes established in FSESs of BSPs, the external review in respect of the quality of students' training is not carried out.

When making the conclusion on the compliance of the content and the quality of the students' training with the FSES requirements of the relevant BSP declared for state accreditation, the expert uses recommended by NAA indicators of the students' training content and quality meeting the FSES requirements.

5.1. Preliminary analysis

The expert plans the external review procedure in accordance with the executive order of the accreditation body, the assignment for conducting the external review, the application of the educational organization for state accreditation of educational activities. The expert makes a preliminary analysis of the information by examining the received package of documents: application for state accreditation, data on the delivery of the BSPs declared for state accreditation, and analysis of the information on the official website (if any)¹. The expert can also use information and analytical materials of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation (results of the monitoring of the HEIs' efficiency, monitoring of the graduates' employment, etc.).

Based on the results of the preliminary analysis of the information, documents and materials of the EO (its branch), the expert further plans his actions in accordance with the task assigned to him and the dates of the review. The results of the preliminary analysis of the information, documents, and materials are verified during the external review.

¹ With the exceptions of the programmes containing the information constituting state secret and those under the jurisdiction of the Federal Security Service of the Russian Federation, Federal Guard Service of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Defence of the Russian Federation

5.2. Carrying out the external review with a site visit to the educational organization or its branch

When conducting an external review with a site visit to an educational organization or its branch, the members of an expert panel shall show a head or other official representative of the educational organization identity documents, the head of the expert panel shall present a copy of the executive order of an accreditation body on conducting the external review.

The EO or its branch provides members of the expert panel with workplaces with Internet access. The EO's representative responsible for state accreditation of BSP shows the local normative act on his/her appointment.

Apart from the documents mentioned above, the expert panel members conducting an on-site external review of study programs containing information constituting a state secret are admitted to the educational organization or its branch on presentation of certificate of admission to the information constituting state secrets according to the appropriate form and instructions for the assignment. The experts herewith are guided by the requirements of the Law of the Russian Federation of July 21, 1993, № 5485-1 "On State Secrets" and the relevant departmental Regulations.

The members of the expert panel shall work in accordance with the working time schedule established by the internal work order regulations of the organization. If necessary, working hours can run counter to these regulations and it must be agreed with the head of the expert panel and the management of the organization where the external review is conducted.

The time of the expert panel staying in the EO or its branch is established in the civil law contract and is not less than 3 working days.

The organization provides a member of the expert panel with documents and materials necessary for the accreditation expert examination within two hours after his/her arrival to the organization.

In case the documents and materials are not provided, it shall be registered by in the act on the non-submission of the documents (hereinafter – the act) in the expert panel member in the report on the external review and brought to the expert panel head's attention.

The EO's head or its representative must get acknowledged with the act and sign it.

The act shall contain:

- full name of the EO's head or the authorized representative;
- full name of the expert panel member who requested the documents and materials;
- the date of the request for the documents;
- the list of documents not submitted upon the written request for documents;
- date of the act.

The fact of the non-submission of the documents is registered by the expert panel member in his/her report on the external review and by the head of the expert panel in the expert panel conclusion.

The act is attached to the expert's report on the external review.

Documents and materials required for the accreditation external review shall be submitted by the organization carrying out educational activities for the period corresponding to the period corresponding to the period of mastering this study program. These documents and materials can be submitted in the form of an electronic document signed with an electronic signature as established by the legislation of the Russian Federation, including on electronic media.

In case of external review of study programs with no graduates in the current academic year in the organization carrying out educational activities, the documents and materials requested by the expert panel (accreditation body) shall be submitted by the organization for the period of the study program delivery.

It is not allowed to request from the EO for the documents and materials which are not included in the list of documents and materials required for conducting the accreditation external review, established by Federal Service on Supervision in Education and Science, and also documents and materials on paper in case they are published on the official site on the Internet or in EO's electronic systems in the form of the electronic document with the e-signature of the EO's head. The EO's head is responsible for providing the expert panel with access to such documents as well as for their actuality and reliability.

The expert panel shall have the right to see the original documents and materials posted on the EO's official website on the Internet in order to verify them.

In case of revealing the falsity of the information provided by the EO, the act is drawn up. It contains the following information:

- - full name of the EO's head (authorized representative);
- full name of the head and the member of the expert panel;
- list of documents and materials containing false information;
- description of the false information;
- date of the act.

The act is signed by the expert and the head of the expert panel. The act is presented to the EO's head (authorized representative) and he/she signs it.

The external review is carried out by:

- analyzing the documents and materials submitted by the EO on the delivery of the BSPs declared for state accreditation;
- evaluating the quality of EO's assessment materials for conducting interim and final attestation;
- assessing the teaching and methodological support of all types of classes (classroom and independent work, term works (projects), etc.) specified in the curriculum;
- assessing the conditions for the implementation of the BSPs declared for state accreditation: system-wide requirements, staffing, logistical, educational and methodological support of the program;
- assessing the quality of the students' training.

Compliance of the quality of the EO students' training in the BSPs with the FSES requirements is determined by the results of students' testing (results of training and results of BSP mastering) using the EO's assessment materials. If it is the first year of the BSP implementation and no interim attestation has been carried out, the quality of students' training is assessed by means of the external review of the assessment materials. During the external review of BSPs implemented by the educational standards established by the educational organization independently, the external review in terms of the content of students' training is not carried out.

As part of the assessment of the quality of students' training, the expert panel analyzes the results of professional and public accreditation and also takes into account the results of an independent evaluation of the quality of students' training submitted to the accreditation body and carried out by legal entities carrying out an independent evaluation of the quality of students' training (in accordance with Article 95.1 of the Federal Law "On Education") during the 3 years prior to the day of submission of the application for state accreditation. The expert panel also takes into account the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality received as part of international comparative research in education in accordance with the criteria and requirements of Russian, foreign and international organizations.

In case the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality confirm the compliance of the training quality in the BSPs declared for state accreditation with the learning outcomes established in FSESs, the external review in respect of the quality of students' training shall not be carried out.

In order to analyze the compliance of the EO's electronic information educational environment (EIEE) and electronic library system (ELS) with the FSES requirements, the expert is provided with a login and password to enter the system. The expert checks the compliance of the EIEE functioning with the FSES requirements. In case of non-compliance with the FSES requirements the expert shall draw up acts:

- on the impossibility of access to the EO's EIEE;
- on non-compliance of the EO's EIEE with the FSES requirements in terms of content with the list of the violations found.

Acts are signed by the expert and the head of the expert panel. To the acts, they must attach the screenshots certified by the expert, EO's local regulatory act on the EIEE functioning, and other documents.

If during the on-site external review the expert has identified non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements, he/she informs the expert panel head about the identified non-compliance.

The expert panel head informs the EO's head or the authorized representative about the identified non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements.

Within 5 days from the date of receipt of the information on the identified non-compliance the organization carrying out educational activities has the right to take measures to eliminate the revealed non-compliance and provide

the expert panel with the documents confirming the non-compliance elimination, including in the form of an electronic document signed by the head of the educational organization.

5.3. Carrying out the external review without a site visit to the educational organization or its branch

The external review of the content and quality of the students' training is conducted without a site visit in cases provided by paragraphs 34-35 of the Regulations on state accreditation of educational activities.

When conducting external review without the site visit, members of the expert panel shall work in accordance with the working time schedule established by the internal work order regulations of NAA. If necessary, working hours can run counter to these regulations and shall be agreed with the head of the expert panel and NAA.

The accreditation body requests the EO for the documents and materials necessary for the external review in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia of 9.11.2016 № 1385.

The head of the expert panel receives from NAA's officer the EO's documents and materials by an inventory/list according to the accreditation body request and provide them to the expert panel members.

The expert checks the availability of all documents and materials by the inventory/list. In case the educational organization has provided an incomplete package of documents and materials for carrying out the external review, the head of the expert panel draws up an act of non-submission of documents and materials by the educational organization, which should be signed by the head and expert panel members.

The expert (representative of the expert organization) and the head of the expert panel should record this non-submission in the external review report and conclusion.

The act is attached to the expert's report on the external review.

The sequence of the expert's actions during the external review without a site visit coincides with that one used when conducting an external review with a site visit except for the actions impossible to be performed without a site visit to the educational organization.

The expert evaluates the quality of students' training in the BSPs by analyzing the students' works and the assessment materials submitted by the EO.

If during the external review the expert reveals non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements, he/she informs the head of the expert panel about the revealed non-compliance.

The expert registers it in the report on the external review specifying the FSES requirement (item) and a list of documents confirming this non-compliance.

Upon completion of the external review (the dates are specified in the executive order of the accreditation body), the head of the expert panel draws

up the conclusion of experts and/or representatives of the expert organizations based on the experts' reports on the external review in the established form.

5.4. Carrying out the external review in an e-form

The external review in an e-form is conducted without a site visit. The experts (representatives of expert organizations) work with the documents and materials submitted by the EO necessary for the external review in their personal accounts in ISSA or using the Internet file exchange services, depending on the scope of documents and data sent from the EO.

The personal account of the head of the expert panel provides the access to all the documents and materials submitted by the EO for external review in an e-form, documents drawn up experts during the external review, as well as the opportunity to supervise the experts' work. In case of using third-party services for file exchange, all the experts must have access to all the documents (links to the third-party services) provide by the EO in an e-form.

In his/her personal account in ISSA, the expert (representative of the expert organization) have access to the EO's documents and materials assigned to him/her in accordance with the Rosobrnadzor's executive order on conducting the external review in an e-form and in accordance with the assignment on carrying out the external review in the e-form.

When conducting the external review, the expert panel use documents, materials, and information provided by the organization for the state accreditation of educational activities in accordance with the requirements established by legislation in education.

When conducting the external review in e-form, the expert panel determine the reliability/falsity of the information provided by the organization on the implementation of each educational programme. The reliability/falsity of the information provided by the organization is carried out by comparing it with the information on the actual implementation of each educational programme posted on the official website of the organization on the Internet and (or) in the documents and materials received upon request and posted in the personal account of the organization in the ISSA.

When conducting the external review in e-form, the expert panel determine the compliance of the BSP content with the FSES requirements by using the documents and materials submitted by the organization in e-form. Compliance of the quality of students' training in EO's BSPs with the FSES is determined by the results of distance testing of students (training results and results of mastering the BSP). When conducting the external review of programs implemented by educational standards established by an educational organization independently, the external review in terms of the content of students' training is not conducted.

Upon completion of the external review, the expert panel members in the ISSA personal account of the expert (representative of the expert organization) draw up reports on the external review with regard to the BSPs assigned to them, and the head of the expert panel draws up the expert panel conclusion based on the experts' reports on the external review. The reports on the external review and the expert panel conclusion are signed by the members of the expert

panel with a qualified e-signature and posted in the ISSA personal account of the expert (representative of the expert organization).

If the expert (representative of the expert organization) does not have a qualified e-signature, the scanned copies of the signed reporting documents are posted in the ISSA personal account of the expert (representative of the expert organization), and the originals of the reporting documents are sent to NAA by mail.

6. REPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Upon the completion of the external review procedure shall prepare the conclusion of an expert panel based on external review reports drawn up in accordance with the external review findings (hereinafter referred to as external review conclusion), and on the day established in the accreditation body's executive order shall send it to the accreditation body with the external review reports attached.

The forms of the report on the external review and the expert panel conclusion are established by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation.

External review report shall contain the specification of the content and quality of students' training in the organization's study programs declared for state accreditation, a list of documents and (or) materials reviewed during the procedure of external review and the students' training assessment results together with the methods and tools used for the learning outcomes assessment.

In case of non-submission of the documents and materials during the external review, the act on non-submission of the documents is attached to the report on external review.

In case of revealing the non-compliance of the educational programme with the FSES, the report must contain the information on the FSES item/article with which the non-compliance has been identified, as well as a detailed description of the revealed non-compliance. To the report on the external review, the expert attaches copies of the EO's documents confirming the non-compliance or copies of documents and materials posted on the official website in the Internet, certified by the e-signature of the EO's head.

If during the external review the organization carrying out educational activities has made changes to the documents to eliminate the identified non-compliance, the report shall contain the relevant information and copies of the documents.

In case the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality confirm the compliance of the training quality in the basic study programmes declared for state accreditation with the learning outcomes established in FSEs, the external review in respect of the quality of students' training shall not be carried out. The report on the external review shall contain the information on the results of an independent evaluation of the students' training quality.

It is forbidden to include several educational programmes in one report on the external review.

The expert signing the report on the external review is responsible for its proper completion and reliability of the information in the report.

Upon the completion of the external review, the members of the expert panel submit the reports on the external review to the head of the expert panel and send the e-copy of the report (scanned copy) to the NAA's email within one working day from the date of handing over of the report and post them in the ISSA personal account.

Expert panel conclusion shall contain the following information:

- a) the date of the expert panel conclusion;
- b) full name of an educational organization or its branch which were subject to external review;
- c) information on the documents and materials provided by the educational organization or its branch for external review, as well as the information on the drawn-up act on non-submission of the documents (if any);
- d) specification of the content and quality of students' training in the study programs declared for state accreditation and the information on the identified non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of students' training with the FSES requirements (there shall be a note of their elimination during the external review if it happened so), or the conclusion on compliance of the content and the quality of students' training with the relevant FSES requirements for each study program declared for state accreditation.

The expert panel conclusion is considered negative in case it contains the following information:

- a) information on non-submission of the documents and (or) materials to an expert panel member or its head by the organization carrying out the educational activity or its branch;

- b) information on the revealed and not eliminated non-compliance of the content and (or) quality of the students' training with the FSES requirements in the study programmes declared for state accreditation during the external review; the non-compliance can concern:

- structure of the basic study programmes and their scope;

- personnel and material and technical conditions of study programmes implementation;

- results of study programmes acquisition.

The external review reports and the conclusion on the external review results with regard to professional study programmes containing information constituting the State secret must not contain information constituting the State secret.

Within 3 working days from the receipt of the expert panel conclusion, the accreditation body shall send its copy to an educational organization or hand it with signed acknowledgment to an authorized representative of the educational organization and shall publish it on the official website on the Internet.

7. PROCEDURE FOR MAKING THE DECISION ON STATE ACCREDITATION, REFUSAL OF STATE ACCREDITATION

Based on the conclusion of an expert panel and the act on external review results, the accreditation body together with the collegial body of the accreditation body (hereinafter – collegial body) shall make a decision on granting state accreditation or refusal of state accreditation.

The collegial body is a permanent body and acts under the provisions approved by the accreditation body. The collegial body members shall be determined by the accreditation body. Decisions of the collegial body shall be registered in a protocol and shall be advisory for the accreditation body.

The accreditation body shall consider the expert panel conclusion and decide whether the content and quality of students' training at the educational organization and at each of its branches correspond or don't correspond to the federal state educational standards with regard to the level of education, integrated groups of professions, specialties and field of training of each educational program declared for state accreditation.

The grounds for the refusal of state accreditation of educational activities in the BSPs declared for state accreditation:

- 1) false information identified in the documents submitted by an educational organization;
- 2) negative conclusion of the expert panel.

The decision of state accreditation of educational activities or refusal of state accreditation is published by the accreditation body on its official website on the Internet.

To improve the procedure of state accreditation, upon completion of the external review, the NAA officer sends feedback questionnaires to the EO and all the members of the expert panel.