

**Letter of the Ministry of Education and Science of
Russia of 15.02.2018
N 05-436**

**“On Methodological recommendations”
(with “Methodological recommendations for the
organization and conduct of an internal independent
quality assessment of the education in educational
organizations of higher education on the educational
programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs,
specialist's programs, and master's programs”)**

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

DEPARTMENT OF STATE POLICY IN HIGHER EDUCATION

LETTER

of February 15, 2018, N 05-436

ON METHODOLOGICAL RECOMMENDATIONS

In the fulfillment of the order of the President of the Russian Federation of November 27, 2014, N Or-2748 (sub-paragraph "a" of paragraph 2) following the results of the plenary session of the X Congress of the All-Russian public organization "Russian Union of Rectors" of October 30, 2014, and in order to improve the quality of education, the Department of State Policy in Higher Education provides methodological recommendations on the organization and conduct of an internal independent assessment of the education quality in educational organizations of higher education.

The Department emphasizes that this document is recommendatory. The list of activities for internal independent quality assessment of education described in the Methodological Recommendations is not complete. Higher education organizations may add other elements of an independent quality assessment of education.

In April 2018, we plan to monitor the implementation of internal independent quality assessment mechanisms in higher education organizations. During this monitoring, the mechanisms of independent assessment of the quality of students' training, the quality of teaching staff's work, and the quality of resource support of the educational process will be analyzed.

The Department also underlines that information on the implementation of the internal independent assessment of education quality in higher education organizations is to be included into the Monitoring of the main activities of the educational organization of higher education, conducted annually by the Ministry of Education and Science within the implementation of the Russian Federation Government Decree of August 5, 2013 N 662 "On monitoring of the education system".

Director of the Department
A.B.SOBOLEV

Annex

Methodological recommendations for the organization and conduct of an internal independent quality assessment of the education in educational organizations of higher education on the educational programs of higher education - bachelor's degree programs, specialist's programs, and master's programs

1. General provisions

The organization and conduct of the external independent quality assessment of the of educational services provided by educational organizations are regulated by the Federal Law of December 29, 2012, N 273-FL "On Education in the Russian Federation" (Articles 95, 95.1, 95.2) and other legislative acts, including the Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of August 5, 2013 N 662 "On monitoring of the education system". The external independent assessment of the education quality involves public and public professional organizations, non-state, autonomous nonprofit organizations, and individuals as experts in the education quality assessment.

Meanwhile, the current legislation of the Russian Federation in education does not regulate the implementation of internal independent assessment of the education quality involving mainly internal resources of the educational organization. In contrast to the external assessment, the internal assessment can be carried out by educational organizations continuously. Moreover, the assessment results can be introduced into the educational organization's activities more quickly and effectively.

The main objectives of the internal independent quality assessment of the education (hereinafter - IQAE) in an educational organization are as follows:

1. Make the most objective quality assessment of the students' training as the results of mastering the study programs.
2. Improve the structure and update the content of study programs implemented in the educational organization.
3. Improve the resource support of the educational process in the educational organization.
4. Improve the competence and qualification level of the teaching staff involved in the study program implementation in the educational organization.
5. Increase the students' motivation to master study programs.

6. Enhance the interaction of the educational organization with the enterprises and organizations of relevant profiles to improve the educational process.

7. Fight against corruption in the educational process.

These methodological recommendations are intended for educational organizations implementing study programs of higher education - bachelor's, specialist's, and master's degree programs (hereinafter - SPHE). The recommendations describe possible variants of the organization and conduct of the internal independent quality assessment of education by the Russian educational organizations of higher education (further - educational organizations, EO) in accordance with the current legislation of the Russian Federation. The recommendations don't limit educational organizations in using other variants of the organization and conduct of internal IQAE, different from the described.

The recommendations describe the peculiarities of organization and conduct of internal IQAE within the framework of an independent quality assessment of the students' training, quality of the work of the teaching staff of educational organizations, as well as the quality of resource support of educational activities. Moreover, the recommendations address the issues of legal and regulatory support of the internal IQAE, as well as using its results in the activities of the educational organization.

2. Organization and conduct of an internal independent quality assessment of the students' training

It is recommended to carry out an internal independent quality assessment of the students' training in the educational organization within:

- interim attestation of students by disciplines (modules);
- interim attestation of students upon the results of practice;
- interim attestation of students upon the results of coursework and projects, participation in project activities;
- entrance control of the students' level of training at the beginning of the discipline (module);
- control of the students' learning outcomes in previously studied disciplines (modules);
- analysis of the students' portfolio of educational and extra-curricular achievements;

- Olympiads and other competitive events in some disciplines (modules);
- state final attestation of students.

2.1 Internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation of students by disciplines (modules)

The independent quality assessment of the level of students' mastery of the discipline (module) can be implemented by making commissions to conduct an interim assessment of students. This measure is also aimed at preventing corruption during the interim attestation. In addition to the teaching staff member who conducted classes in a discipline (module), it is advisable to include the following member to the commission:

- the teaching staff of the educational division involved in the implementation of the respective discipline (module) but who have not conducted classes in it;
- the teaching staff of other educational divisions implementing similar disciplines (modules);
- the teaching staff of other educational organizations implementing similar disciplines (modules);
- representatives of organizations and enterprises relevant to the SPHE field.

In order to collect and analyze information on the procedures of students' interim attestation, and to control the compliance of these procedures with the requirements of local regulations of the organization, the commission may additionally include employees of the subdivision responsible for the quality management of educational activities in the educational organization. The presence of such a subdivision in the structure of an educational organization is an important condition for the successful implementation of internal IQAE.

The list of disciplines (modules) for the interim attestations by the commissions can be determined by the SPHE head or the head of the quality management subdivision of the educational organization.

The review and approbation of the assessment tools used in the interim attestation are recommended to be carried out with the involvement of representatives of organizations and enterprises corresponding to the SPHE field, or teaching staff of other educational organizations. In addition, the interim attestation can be carried out with the use of the assessment tools funds developed by third-party organizations (including expert organizations).

In case the interim attestation is conducted in the form of testing, in order to ensure maximum objectivity and evaluation independence, it is recommended

to create specialized testing services in an educational organization and to regularly update the test pools and carry out their expertise.

In order to carry out internal IQAE, they can use the test pools for disciplines (modules) developed by an educational organization and published on leading educational online platforms.

2.2 Internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation of students upon the results of practice

It is advised that students should complete the practice with the defense of their practice reports. For maximum objectivity and independence of the quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation on the results of practice, it is recommended to:

- create commissions with the representatives of the organizations and enterprises where the practice was conducted, in order to conduct the interim attestation of the students upon the practice results;
- to conduct the interim attestation of students directly in the organizations and enterprises where the practice took place;
- to develop, review, and approve the assessment tools funds used in the interim attestation with the involvement of the representatives of the above organizations and enterprises.

2.3 Internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation of students upon the results of coursework and projects, as well as their participation in project activities.

For maximum objectivity and independence of the quality assessment of the students' training in the attestation upon the results of coursework and projects, as well as participation in project activities, it is recommended to:

- when assigning students the project tasks, whenever possible, give preference to the topics provided by the representatives of the organizations and the enterprises of the corresponding SPHE field, and topics representing real production task or a current research task (in case the course papers or the projects are part of research work);
- check the explanatory note to the project (work) or the manuscript for plagiarism before the project (work) defense;
- involve representatives of organizations and enterprises corresponding to the SPHE field in the commission to carry out the procedure of the project (work) defense.

Solution of real and current production (research) tasks under the leading specialists' guidance not only increases the students' motivation to master the SPHE but also contributes to strengthening the interaction of educational organizations with specialized enterprises and organizations on improving the educational process.

2.4 Internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the entrance control of the level of students' training at the beginning of the discipline (module)

The entrance control of students' knowledge, skills and abilities is carried out at the beginning of studying the discipline (module) and helps to evaluate the quality of students' training in the previous disciplines (modules) necessary for successful mastering of the specified discipline (module), and also to improve and update of teaching methods in the disciplines (modules).

Taking into account the goals and objectives of the program, the SPHE head determines the knowledge, skills, and abilities and the list of disciplines (modules) to be tested within the entrance control. The SPHE head systematizes and analyzes the entrance control, and on this basis, he/she can recommend the measures to the teaching staff to improve and update teaching methods and content of the corresponding disciplines (modules), to make students' individual learning paths.

2.5 Internal independent quality assessment of students' training within the control of the students' learning outcomes in previously studied disciplines (modules)

The control of the students' learning outcomes (knowledge, skills, and abilities) in previously studied disciplines (modules) is recommended to be carried out not earlier than 6 months after the completion of this discipline. This kind of control helps to get an independent quality assessment of the students' training in the previously studied disciplines (modules). The educational organization determines the forms of control independently. Selective control of the students' learning outcomes in previously studied disciplines (modules) can be implemented in the framework of the annual self-assessment of the educational organization. It makes sense to make this control interdisciplinary.

In order to reduce costs, it is advisable to carry out this control in the form of computer testing. It is also acceptable to use a remote form as online testing if technically feasible in the educational organization to identify a student in the testing process. Testing on the basis of remote educational technologies can also be implemented using third-party educational Internet resources.

The organization of control of the students' learning outcomes in previously studied disciplines (modules) should be carried out by the education organization's division responsible for quality management of educational activities.

The results of control of the students' learning outcomes in previously studied disciplines (modules) should be available to students in their personal accounts in electronic information and educational environment (hereinafter - EIEE).

2.6 Internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the analysis of the students' portfolios of educational and extra-curricular achievements

The student's portfolio of educational and extracurricular achievements supplements traditional control and assessment tools. It helps to take into account the results achieved by students in different activities: educational, research, creative, social, communicative, etc.

The purpose of making up the portfolio is to:

- support high learning motivation of students;
- encourage students to be active and self-reliant, and to support opportunities for learning and self-study;
- develop the students' skills of reflection and evaluation (self-assessment);
- develop the students' ability to plan and organize their own learning activities;
- contribute to individualization (personalization) of students' education;
- create additional opportunities for efficient socialization;
- tracking of every student's individual progress in a wide educational context, demonstrate their abilities to apply the acquired knowledge and skills in practical work.

A portfolio is an effective tool for an independent rating of students' individual educational achievements indicating the quality of their training. The procedure of using the students' portfolios in SPHE during the internal IQAE procedure is determined by each educational organization independently.

2.7 Internal independent assessment of the quality of students' training within the Olympiads and other competitive events in disciplines (modules)

Subject Olympiads for students are an important component of students' extracurricular activities. They help to reveal the most talented students, as well as

contribute to in-depth study of the discipline (module), prepare for future professional activity, form an active life position.

The educational organization's division managing the quality of educational activities as well as the relevant subject departments should organize Olympiads at the level of an educational organization. The Olympiad results are recommended to be included in the student's portfolio.

The students' participation in SPHE's subject Olympiads of different levels, their results, and the level of these Olympiads can be a basis for an internal independent quality assessment of students' training in the SPHE.

It is reasonable to include materials from several interrelated disciplines (modules) in the content of the subject Olympiads' tasks, and the tasks themselves should encourage participants to show their competence and be creative. Case studies may serve as one of the possible forms of such tasks.

2.8 Implementation of an internal independent quality assessment of students' training within the state final attestation of trainees

Some IQAE mechanisms have already been implemented in the procedure of state final attestation at the legislative level in the Procedure of state final attestation for higher education programs - bachelor's, specialist and master's degree programs (approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia of June 29, 2015 N 636). According to the Procedure, the state final attestation is conducted by state examination commissions. The approved chairman of the state examination commission can't work in the organization, he/she must have the academic degree of Doctor of Science and (or) the academic title of professor or can be a leading specialist - representative of employers or their associations in the relevant field of professional activity.

The Procedure also establishes the minimum allowed number of the state examination commission members who are leading specialists - representatives of employers or their associations in the relevant field of professional activity (including the chairman of the state examination commission).

Thus, IQAE as part of the state final attestation is mainly ensured by means of involving independent experts.

In addition, it is recommended to:

- when assigning a student a topic for graduation qualification work, give preference to the topics provided by representatives of organizations and enterprises corresponding to the SPHE field; the topic should be a real and up-to-date production (research) task;

- check the graduation qualification work against plagiarism before the defense procedure.

At present, it is allowed to perform graduation qualification work in the form of a startup. At the same time, it is advisable to involve potential investors in the procedure of the project defense in order to ensure independence of the evaluation.

The IQAE results within the state final attestation can be to improve the structure and update the content of SPHE implemented in the educational organization.

3. Organization and conduct of an internal independent quality assessment of the teaching staff's work in the educational organization

It is recommended that the internal independent quality assessment of the work of the teaching staff involved in the SPHE implementation in the educational organization should be carried out within:

- pedagogical skills competitions;
- systematic monitoring of the teaching staff's qualification;
- analysis of the teaching staff's portfolios of professional achievements;
- procedures for quality assessment of teaching staff's work by students.

3.1 Internal independent quality assessment of the teaching staff's work in the educational organization within the pedagogical skills competitions

Pedagogical skills competitions among the teaching staff of the educational organization are one of the effective means to enhance the teaching staff's professionalism and a source to obtain the most objective information about their qualifications. These competitions create a favorable motivational environment for teaching staff's professional development, dissemination of innovative experience, and determining their professional identity.

The competitions are organized by the divisions responsible for the organization and planning of educational and methodical work in an educational organization, as well as employees of the division responsible for quality management of educational activities in an educational organization. At the same time, the top management of the educational organization is to create conditions

for the wide involvement of the teaching staff of the educational organization to participate in the competitions.

3.2 Internal independent quality assessment of the teaching staff's work in the educational organization within the systematic monitoring of the teaching staff's qualification

Conducting monitoring allows the educational organization to assess the teaching staff, forecast their development, while the comparison of the data with planned indicators demonstrates the efficiency of the management decisions in relation to them.

Quality assessment of the teaching staff in the educational organization is an important part of education quality assurance and the basis for solving the problems of the education quality management and students' training quality assessment in the educational organization.

The assessment objectives are to:

- obtain the most objective information about the professional activities of teaching staff in the educational organization;
- determine the compliance of the teaching staff's quality with the requirements of the corresponding professional standard and the requirements of federal state educational standards of higher education to the teaching staff implementing the SPHE;
- analyze the dynamics of the teaching staff's professional level.

Such an assessment can be carried out both by the educational organization's divisions of the quality management of educational activities and by independent experts experienced in conducting such assessment procedures. The developed and justified system of criteria and indicators of teaching staff's performance reduces the subjectivity of the assessment procedures.

When evaluating the overall performance of a teacher, it is important to assess the quality of his/her work in all areas (teaching activities, research work, educational work, etc.).

3.3 Internal independent quality assessment of the teaching staff's work within the analysis of the teaching staff's portfolios of professional achievements

One of the possible forms of monitoring the teaching staff's qualification is to analyze their portfolios of professional achievements.

The portfolio technology helps to analyze the current state of the pedagogical system and its components in the educational organization, objectively assess the personal and professional growth of the teaching staff, and

also provides the opportunity to effectively manage the teaching staff, identify potential, and determine the most rational use of human resources. The portfolios, which are, in fact, a reflection of the results of the teaching staff's professional activities can be used for making the ratings of the teaching staff and motivate the teaching staff and encourage their activities in all areas (educational, methodological, scientific, educational, social work). At the same time, based on the teaching staff's portfolio analysis, the top management of the educational organization can adjust the development strategy of the educational organization.

In addition, thanks to this technology the teaching staff can systematize their experience and knowledge, make self-assessment of professional activities, and determine the individual development strategy (path). The educational organization can publish the portfolios in its EEIE, provide other users of the system with the access to comment, and so receive the feedback.

The results of the teaching staff's portfolio analysis can be a basis for making managerial decisions.

3.4 Internal independent quality assessment of the teaching staff's work by students

The teaching staff's assessment by students does not always provide objective information about the educational activities of the organization, but, nevertheless, it is an important component of the internal IQAE. It is recommended that students assess their teachers in the form of an electronic questionnaire. Students can find these questionnaires in their personal accounts of in the educational organization's EEIE. For the assessment objectivity, the respondents must be authorized to participate in the survey. In the questionnaire, it is advisable to provide students with the opportunity to make suggestions on improving the educational process in an educational organization.

4. Organization and conduct of the internal independent quality assessment of the resource provision for educational activities

The quality of educational services provided by the educational organization is largely determined by the level of material and technical, educational and methodological, library provision (hereinafter referred to as resource provision) of the educational process of the SPHE in the organization. The determination of the compliance of the educational organization's SPHE resource provision with the requirements of the legislation of the Russian Federation in

education is carried out within the licensing, state accreditation, and professional and public accreditation procedures.

It is recommended, that the internal independent quality assessment of the material-technical, educational, methodological, and library provision of the educational organization's SPHE should be carried out as part of the annual self-evaluation procedure in the educational organizations. To conduct the internal independent quality assessment of the SPHE resource provision requires the educational organization approves a self-assessment commission subordinate directly to the head of the organization. The commission should include employees of various educational departments, including those responsible for the organization of the educational process, quality management of education, as well as representatives of organizations and enterprises corresponding to the SPHE field.

Annual self-evaluation is the most important component of a complex of measures to improve the material and technical, teaching and library provision of the educational process in educational organizations, as well as to enhance the competitiveness of SPHEs implemented in educational organizations.

The procedure for conducting the internal independent quality assessment of the SPHE resource provision is determined by the educational organization independently. It is advisable to include students' questionnaires in the independent assessment procedure.

5. Use of the results of the internal independent quality assessment in the educational organization's activities

The procedure for using the results of an internal independent quality assessment of education in the educational organization is determined by the educational organization independently. It is recommended to use the following algorithm for using the internal IQAE results:

1. The all the results collected in different activities within the internal IQAE are analyzed at the level of the SPHE heads and at the level of the head of the educational organization, with the participation of heads of responsible for the organization of the educational process and its quality.

2. Based on this analysis, they collectively develop the action plan to eliminate the identified violations and shortcomings and further improve the quality of the educational process. The plan should contain a list of activities, terms

for their implementation, the names of divisions responsible for their implementation, as well as a description of the planned results. It is advisable to make the action plan publically available and published on the official website of the educational organization to ensure that all stakeholders can get acknowledged with it.

3. The heads of the structural divisions listed in the plan (officials) take measures to implement the plan and submit a report on the results to the educational organization's division responsible for the quality management of the educational process.

4. The head of the division responsible for the quality management of the educational process checks the correct execution of the action plan activities and analyzes reports of the heads of structural divisions (officials) responsible for their execution.

5. During the action plan implementation, it can be changed accordingly.

6. As a result of the action plan implementation, the head of the division responsible for the quality management of the educational process draws up the final report and provide it to the head of the educational organization.

6. Normative and legal support for internal independent quality assessment of education

According to methodological recommendations of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation on conducting an external independent quality assessment of the educational organization's activities (letter of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia of April 3, 2015, N AP-512/02 "On the methodological recommendations on IQAE "), the IQAE procedure should be based on a number of regulations, including:

- Federal law of April 4, 2005, N 32-FL " On the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation";

- Federal law of December 29, 2012, N 273-FL "On education in the Russian Federation";

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation of May 7, 2012 N 597 "On measures to implement the state social policy";

- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of July 10, 2013 N 582 "On approval of the Rules for posting and updating of the information on the

educational organization on the official website of the educational organization in the information and telecommunications network "Internet";

- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of August 5, 2013, N 662 "On monitoring the education system";

- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of April 15, 2014, N 295 " On approval of the state program of the Russian Federation "Development of education" for 2013-2020";

- Order of the Government of the Russian Federation of March 30, 2013, N 487-o (Action plan for the formation of the independent quality assessment system of organizations providing social services for 2013-2015);

- Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of December 5, 2014, N 1547 "On approval of indicators for the general criteria for quality evaluating of educational activities in organizations carrying out educational activities";

- Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of December 10, 2013, N 1324 "On approval of the performance indicators for self-evaluation of educational organizations";

- Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of June 14, 2013, N 462 "On approval of the procedure for conducting self-evaluation of an educational organization".

The normative legal support of the internal IQAE in higher education institutions should include either a local normative act that fully regulates the procedures of the internal IQAE (for example, " Regulations on conducting an internal independent quality assessment of education in / Name of the educational organization/"), or a set of local normative acts that regulate the conduct of the internal IQAE elements. For example, they may be as follows:

- Regulations on internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation of students in disciplines (modules);

- Regulations on internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation of students upon the results of practice;

- Regulations on internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the interim attestation of students upon the results of coursework and projects, participation in project activities;

- Regulations on internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within Olympiads and other competitive events in some disciplines (modules);

- Regulations on internal independent quality assessment of the students' training within the state final attestation of students;
- Regulations on the procedure for using the results of the internal independent quality assessment of education in the activities of an educational organization,
- etc.

Individual regulations on the internal IQAE may also be included in existing local regulations of an educational organization, for example:

- Regulations on conducting monitoring and interim attestation of students;
- Regulations on the state final attestation of students;
- Regulations on conducting an annual self-evaluation of an educational organization;
- Regulations on the EEIE of an educational organization;
- Regulations on the quality management system, etc.

The specific list of local regulations to be developed (updated) is determined by the educational organization independently.

It is advisable that the educational organization's divisions responsible for the organization and quality management of the educational process should develop (update) the local regulations.